

COMMITTEE REPORT

Committee: East Area
Date: 14 June 2007

Ward: Clifton
Parish: Clifton Planning Panel

Reference: 06/02362/GRG3
Application at: Haxby Road County Primary School Haxby Road York YO31 8JN
For: Erection of two single storey extensions and internal alterations to existing school, new covered play area, conversion of outbuildings to cycle stores and construction of replacement ramp
By: Education Committee
Application Type: General Regulations (Reg3)
Target Date: 29 December 2006

1.0 PROPOSAL

1.1 The site lies in Haxby Road County Primary School in Clifton. The school is one of a series of schools designed by the distinguished York architect W H Brierley. It was built in 1903-4 and is listed as grade II. Planning permission has been sought to carry out the following development:

- i. Erection of single storey detached linked structures. Both structures would be linked by passageways from the side elevations of the existing building,
- ii. Construction of a new covered play area,
- iii. Conversion of outbuildings to cycle stores,
- iv. Construction of replacement ramp, and
- v. External alterations to the layout of the site.

1.2 The site area is given as 0.9 hectare.

1.3 The work proposed would also include internal alterations to the existing school building. Planning permission would not be required for internal alterations. Hence the internal work proposed will not be considered in the determination of this planning application. However the above internal alterations and developments will be considered in the determination of a Listed Building Consent application.

1.4 Both the northern and the southern structures would measure 9.9m x 6.0m and 13.9m x 7.6m respectively. They would both be constructed of a combination of aluminium and glass materials.

1.5 The latest revised scheme submitted shows both structures have moved further back from the front elevation to reveal the set of windows in the side elevations of the listed building. In addition, the higher connecting elements linking the structures

with the main building have been removed and have been replaced by 2.6m high aluminium passageways.

1.6 A number of alterations have also been proposed to the layout of the site. This include the rearrangement of existing parking and part of the playground areas to provide 15 marked parking bays within the site, rearrangement of pedestrian routes from Haxby Road to the play area to the front of the main building, and erection of fences / enclosures.

1.7 Other development proposed include the construction of a 13.6m x 8.4m soft surface play area to the front of the main building, the construction of a 2.0m high ramp outside the main entrance on the front elevation of the building, and the conversion of a 8.5m x 2.0m outbuilding to staff cycle storage area. A total of 10 Sheffield stands are proposed to be located within the building, which is sited to the rear of the application site. The physical appearance of the outbuilding would not be changed by virtue of the development.

1.8 In relation to the surroundings, part of the development would be directly facing a row of terrace houses along White Cross Road to the south. A number of industrial / warehouse units are sited to the north of the site.

1.9 RELEVANT PLANNING HISTORY

1.10 99/02301/GRG3: Erection of single storey pitched roof canteen building. This application was withdrawn on 10.11.1999.

1.11 99/02588/GRG3: Erection of single storey pitched roof detached kitchen building with link to existing school. This application was withdrawn on 03.02.2003.

1.12 06/02363/LBC: Erection of two single storey extensions and internal alterations to existing school, new covered play area, conversion of outbuildings to cycle stores and replacement ramp. This application is currently under consideration.

2.0 POLICY CONTEXT

2.1 Development Plan Allocation:

City Boundary York City Boundary 0001

DC Area Teams East Area (2) 0005

Listed Buildings Grade 2 Haxby Road School Haxby Road 0291

Schools Haxby Road Primary 0198

2.2 Policies:

CYT5

Traffic and pedestrian safety

CYGP1
Design

CYGP3
Planning against crime

CYHE2
Development in historic locations

CYED3
Change of use of Pre-School, Primary and Secondary Educational Facilities

CYED11
Protection of Playing Fields

3.0 CONSULTATIONS

INTERNAL:

3.1 Urban Design and Conservation Section: latest response received 17 May 2007 -
The following comments have been made:

- The revised proposals presented presently appear to have addressed earlier concerns raised by the Council's Conservation Officer and English Heritage,
- The new locations of the units and their overall height relative to this substantial building would appear to reduce harm to the setting of the listed building,
- Overall there has been a significant improvement to the appearance of the scheme.
- Conditions recommended.

3.2 Highway Network Management: Latest response received 17 May 2007 - no highway objections subject to conditions and informative.

3.3 Environmental Protection Unit: response received 1 December 2006 - conditions and informative recommended.

EXTERNAL

3.4 English Heritage: Latest response received 15 May 2007 - no objections to the principle of the scheme. However it is suggested that access should be gained by means of an openable window or door to the internal courtyard beneath the chimney for cleaning and general maintenance. It is also suggested that high quality materials and detailing will be paramount to the success of the extensions.

3.5 Sport England: Response received 21 December 2006 and 11 May 2007 - Sport England has no objection because whilst a small amount of playing field land would be lost it would be land incapable of forming (part of) a playing pitch.

3.6 Clifton Planning Panel: Latest response received 23 May 2007 - The panel is pleased with the alterations and therefore has no objections.

3.7 York Civic Trust: Response received 2 January 2007 - the trust objected due to the following reasons:

- it seems inconceivable that elevations for extension on the north and south ends of this building should be proposed with such insensitive designs and materials,
- it would appear that the Government advice has not been observed by the agents dealing with this application,
- the proposal would seriously harm the character and setting of this listed building.

The Trust were re-consulted on 20th April 2007 on the revised scheme. No response received.

3.8 North Yorkshire Police Architectural Liaison Officer: Response received 31 May 2007 - No objections subject to a Secured by Design condition should permission be granted.

4.0 APPRAISAL

4.1 The main issues to be considered are as follows:

- i. Change of Use of Educational Facilities
- ii. Design and Development in a Historic Location
- iii. Traffic and Pedestrian safety
- iv. Loss of playing areas
- v. Planning against crime

Change of Use of Educational Facilities:

4.2 The purpose of this development is to utilize the vacant space within an existing listed building to provide an appropriate environment for a new children's centre. It is believed that by combining the two uses (the existing primary school and the proposed children's centre) within the site would bring new life to the building as well as encouraging the integration of the wider community with the existing school.

4.3 According to the information provided by the Council's Learning Culture and Children's Services, the school is suffering from falling rolls. The current surplus of 46% is projected to rise to 51% in 2009. This situation has thus created spare capacity within the building to be used by the Integrated Children's Centre (ICC).

4.4 Furthermore, even with the new ICC facilities within the building there remains capacity for 78 extra pupil places. It is estimated that this would take the development of 312 new family units in the school catchment area to generate this number of extra pupils. Hence it is considered that the alternative use of part of the building is acceptable and that the proposal would not be in conflict with policy ED3 of the City of York Draft Local Plan 2005.

Design and Development in a Historic Location:

4.5 Policy HE2 of the City of York Draft Local Plan 2005 states development proposals in locations which affect the setting of listed buildings must respect

adjacent buildings, open spaces, landmarks and setting and have regard to local scale, proportion, details and materials. Furthermore the development is required to contribute to the character or appearance of the area.

4.6 In the case of this development, out of a number of works proposed it would appear that the proposed 'pods' (the proposed northern and southern linked structures) would have the most notable impact on the setting and the appearance of this grade II listed building.

4.7 Based on the current thinking that new additions to historic buildings should truly reflect the architectural characteristics of the time they were built, should be subservient to the main building and should be removable and partially detached in order to reduce their harms to the fabric of the historic building, it is considered that the proposed linked structures have fulfilled these criteria and have been designed in a way that would create minimal harm to the fabric of the listed building. Furthermore, the latest revised scheme shows both linked structures have moved further back from the front elevation of the building so that important features of the listed building can still be seen. They would be sited in less prominent positions (to the side of the building) so that the main elevations of the building will not be affected.

4.8 Having taken the above into account, it is regarded that the proposed linked structures would have little detrimental visual impact on the character, the appearance and the setting of the listed building. However, as pointed out by the English Heritage's Historic Buildings Inspector, high quality in both the detailing and the materials will be paramount to the success of the extensions. Therefore these are to be strictly controlled by conditions should planning permission be granted. The latest consultation responses received have confirmed that both the English Heritage and the Council's Urban Design and Conservation Unit have no objections to the proposal subject to conditions.

4.9 Other development proposed including the proposed play area with covered play canopy above and the proposed replacement ramp are considered to have little detrimental affect on the listed building.

Traffic and Pedestrian Safety:

4.10 As part of the overall alterations to the site a new pedestrian entrance is to be constructed for access. This will lead into a new pedestrian space in front of the reception units from Haxby Road. Other alterations to the site have also been proposed to segregate vehicle and cycle routes from pedestrian access into the school and into the children's centre. These are considered necessary as well as appropriate measures for improving road safety and for enhancing the street environment.

4.11 The proposed parking and cycle storage areas to the rear of the building, together with the new markings proposed to delineate parking bays would also improve road safety and street environment. Highway Network Management has been consulted and has raised no objection to the latest scheme subject to conditions.

Loss of playing areas

4.12 By virtue of the traffic and pedestrian safety measures proposed a small section of the playing field to the front of the building and a large section of the playground area to the rear would be removed. However, as explained in paragraphs 4.2 - 4.4 above, due to the fact that the school is suffering from falling rolls and such trend is expected to continue, it is unlikely that the proposed loss would result in a lack of playing area. Sport England has been consulted and has raised no objections because whilst a small amount of playing field land would be lost it would be land incapable of forming (part of) a playing pitch.

Planning against crime:

4.13 The proposed improvements of this scale in an existing school could attract crime and/or anti-social behaviour. Hence full details of the measures proposed to prevent crime within the application site is required should planning permission be granted. This can be secured by a 'secured-by-design' condition.

4.14 Having taken the above into account, it is considered that the proposed development accords with the National planning policies and the policies set out in the City of York Local Plan. Hence, this application is recommended for approval.

5.0 CONCLUSION

For the reasons above this application is recommended for approval.

6.0 RECOMMENDATION: Approve

1 TIME2

2 The development hereby permitted shall be carried out only in accordance with the following plans:-

0394/20A, 0394/04A, 0394/02, 0394/03B, 0394/06A, 0394/07A, 0394/08, 0394/10 and 0394/16 as received by the City of York Council on 17 April 2007 and on 30 May 2007

or any plans or details subsequently agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority as amendment to the approved plans.

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt and to ensure that the development is carried out only as approved by the Local Planning Authority.

3 The development shall not come into use until all existing vehicular crossings not shown as being retained on the approved plans have been removed by reinstating the footway to match adjacent levels.

Reason: In the interests of good management of the highway and road safety.

4 HWAY18

5 HWAY19

- 6 Prior to the development coming into use, details shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority of the highway barriers to be erected at the proposed new pedestrian entrance.

Reason: To ensure that the structure complies with highway safety and design requirements in all respects.

- 7 Notwithstanding any proposed materials specified on the approved drawings or in the application form submitted with the application, samples of the external materials to be used for the construction of the new pods shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the commencement of the development. The development shall be carried out using the approved materials.

Reason: So as to achieve a visually cohesive appearance.

- 8 All construction and demolition or refurbishment works and ancillary operations, including deliveries to the site and despatch from the site shall only be carried out between the hours of 08.00 and 18.00 Mondays to Fridays and 09.00 to 13.00 on Saturdays and not at all on Sundays and Bank Holidays.

Reason: To protect the amenity of local residents during the construction of the development.

- 9 Any suspect contaminated materials detected during site works shall be reported to the local planning authority. Any remediation for this contamination shall be agreed with the local planning authority and fully implemented prior to any further development of the site.

Reason: As our in-house research has shown no obvious potential source of contamination at the site, the watching brief is recommended.

- 10 None of the existing trees shown on the approved plans shall be wilfully damaged or destroyed or uprooted, felled, lopped or topped without the previous written consent of the Local Planning Authority. Any trees removed without such consent or dying or being severely damaged or becoming seriously diseased shall be replaced with trees of such size and species unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: The Local Planning Authority considers it important to safeguard these trees in a positive manner so as to secure their continued well being.

- 11 Details of all means of enclosure within the site including the site boundaries shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority

before the development commences and shall be provided before the development is occupied.

Reason: In the interests of the visual amenities of the area.

- 12 Before the commencement of and during building operations, adequate measures shall be taken to protect the existing planting to be retained on this site. This means of protection shall be agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority and shall be implemented prior to the stacking of materials, the erection of site huts or the commencement of building works.

Reason: The existing planting is considered to make a significant contribution to the amenities of this area.

- 13 All works are to be carried out in accordance with BS 5837 (2005) 'Trees in relation to construction'.

Reason: To ensure the protection of trees in relation to construction.

- 14 Prior to the development commencing details that show how 'Secured by Design' principles have been incorporated into the scheme shall be submitted for the written approval of the Local Planning Authority and once approved the development shall be implemented in accordance with the approved 'Secured by Design' details prior to occupation or use of any part of the development hereby approved.

Reason: In the interest of community safety, to reduce the fear of crime and to prevent crime and disorder in accordance with the provisions of Section 17 of the Crime and Disorder Act 1998.

7.0 INFORMATIVES: Notes to Applicant

1. REASON FOR APPROVAL

In the opinion of the Local Planning Authority the proposal, subject to the conditions listed above, would not cause undue harm to interests of acknowledged importance, with particular reference to the existing educational facilities, design and development in a historic location, traffic and pedestrian safety, loss of playing areas and planning against crime. As such the proposal complies with Policies GP1, GP3, HE2, ED3, ED11 and T5 of the City of York Local Plan Deposit Draft.

2. INFORMATIVE:

You are advised that prior to starting on site consent will be required from the Highway Authority for the works being proposed, under the Highways Act 1980 (unless alternatively specified under the legislation or Regulations listed below). For further information please contact the officer named:

Works in the highway - Section 171/Vehicle Crossing - Section 184 - Stuart Partington (01904) 551361

3. The developer's attention should also be drawn to the various requirements for the control of noise on construction sites laid down in the Control of Pollution Act 1974. In order to ensure that residents are not adversely affected by air pollution and noise, the following guidance should be attached to any planning approval, failure to do so could result in formal action being taken under the Control of Pollution Act 1974:

1. The work shall be carried out in such a manner so as to comply with the general recommendations of British Standards BS 5228: Part 1: 1997, a code of practice for "Noise and Vibration Control on Construction and Open Sites" and in particular Section 10 of Part 1 of the code entitled "Control of noise and vibration".

2. All plant and machinery to be operated, sited and maintained in order to minimise disturbance. All items of machinery powered by internal combustion engines must be properly silenced and/or fitted with effective and well-maintained mufflers in accordance with manufacturers instructions.

3. The best practicable means, as defined by Section 72 of the Control of Pollution Act 1974, shall be employed at all times, in order to minimise noise emissions.

4. All reasonable measures shall be employed in order to control and minimise dust emissions, including sheeting of vehicles and use of water for dust suppression.

5. There shall be no bonfires on the site.

4. The applicant is reminded that the development hereby permitted shall not commence until the Listed Building Consent application (06/02363/LBC) has also been approved. Under the Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas) Regulations 1990 if a local planning authority to whom application is made for listed building consent intends to grant listed building consent they shall first notify the Secretary of State of the application, giving particulars of the works for which the consent is required.

Contact details:

Author: Billy Wong Development Control Officer

Tel No: 01904 552750